

Bad Part-Writing Quiz — Answers

d: i — 6 — 6 / 4 vii° i V $\frac{6-5}{4-3}$ VI₆ V₄ V₅ of IV₇ $\left. \begin{array}{l} \text{v} \\ \text{v} \end{array} \right\}$ $\begin{array}{l} 9-8 \\ 6-5 \\ 4-3 \end{array}$
a: i ii V $\frac{6-5}{4-3}$ vi°6

1. Eb in pickup beat (alto) is an unjustified chromatic alteration (not in key sig., not mixture, etc.)
2. Questionable 6/4 on beat 2, m.2. The only common types in this style are passing and cadential.
3. The tenor has a nice running scalar line at the start, but it arrives on a chord 7th (C) on beat 2, m.2, which is not resolved.
4. vii° chord has a doubled leading tone.
5. vii° chord should not be in root position
6. Parallel 8^{ves} on beats 3-4, m.1.
7. Parallel *everything* on beats 3-4, m.1. All 4 voices should not be in similar motion.
8. Direct fifth between outer voices, beats 3-4, m.1. These are also unequal fifths (undesirable).
9. The tritone (C# - G) in the vii° chord does not resolve inwards (G normally falls by step).
10. The "6" (F) is doubled in the cadential 6/4; it is a NCT, so it should not be doubled.
11. Parallel unisons in soprano and alto on beats 1-2-3 of m.2.
12. Strange and unlikely cadence in m.2. In a deceptive cadence, the bass typically moves up by step; if it skips up by a P4th from a V chord, it is virtually always a PAC.
13. Melodic augmented 2nd in the tenor from beat 2 to beat 3, m. 2.
14. The chord 7th (C) in the soprano of beat 1, m.3 is unresolved; since the melody is the given part and cannot be modified, a different chord choice would be better here.
15. Tendency tone (F#) doubled on beat 1, m.3.
16. The G-B-D-F chord on beat 2, m.3, should not be analyzed as a IV7; it is a 2^{ndary} dominant (of C), resolving deceptively. Dominants (2^{ndary} or otherwise) can resolve to their target chords or, if deceptive, to chords a third below their targets.
17. Parallel 5^{ths} between bass and alto, beats 3-4, m. 3.
18. Parallel 8^{ves} between bass and soprano, beats 3-4, m. 3.
19. Parallel everything, beats 3-4, m. 3. All 4 voices should not be in similar motion.
20. The ii chord on beat 4, m.3 is missing a 3rd.
21. The soprano and tenor have B naturals on beat 4, m.3, but the bass is technically a Bb; it needs its own natural sign, since it has not sung a B natural previously in the bar (unlike the tenor).
22. ii is normally diminished in minor keys, but in beat 4, m.3, it is minor for no good reason.
23. In the same spot (beat 4, m.3) the F# in the alto moves to an F nat. in the next bar, against tendency.
24. Overlap between tenor and bass from beat 4, m.3, to the downbeat of m.4.
25. Parallel 5^{ths} between soprano and alto, beats 1-2, m.4.
26. Strange and unlikely cadence in m.4; see #11 for explanation.
27. The final chord is a diminished triad; JS Bach chorale-style cadences are almost always onto stable (i.e., major or minor) triads (not even with chord 7^{ths} in the case of HCs).
28. The bass line does not form an attractive melody; the first 5 beats of the 2nd phrase are good (all stepwise motion), but the rest moves almost entirely by skip (10 skips, 6 steps).
29. The descending 8^{ve} skip in the final bar is preceded by a descending skip of a 5th; large leaps should be preceded and followed by a change of direction.

Some things that are **not** problems include:

30. Doubling the third in the pickup beat; it can be justified because it creates a nice scalar run in the tenor.
31. Repeating the same chord from a weak beat to a strong one at the start; Bach chorales sometimes do this.
32. In bar 3, beats 1-2, the tenor F# temporary leading tone moving to F natural in the alto; this goes against tendency, but is fine because leading tones (temporary or otherwise) can move to chord 7^{ths} in chains of 2^{ndary} dominants. When the same thing occurs 3 beats later, it is not okay, because the F nat. in the last bar is not a chord 7th.